Table of contents

| | | Paragraphs | Pages |
|----------------|---|--------------|-------|
| CHAPTER 1: | EVENTS LEADING TO THE ESTABLISHMENT | | |
| | OF THE COMMISSION | 1-17 | 1-6 |
| Repres of T | entation made by the World Federation rade Unions under article 24 of the | | |
| Examin | Constitutionation of the representation by the | | 1-2 |
| | rning Body and decision to refer matter to a Commission of Inquiry | 0 16 | 2-4 |
| | tment of the Commission | 17 | 4-5 |
| Appoin | tment of the Commission | desertal cla | 4-3 |
| CHAPTER 2: | PROCEDURE FOLLOWED BY THE | | |
| | COMMISSION | 18-66 | 7-35 |
| First | session | 18-32 | 7-9 |
| | ications received following the | | 1 2 |
| | t session on questions of procedure | | 9-19 |
| Commun | ications received following the | | |
| | t session on the substance of | | |
| the | case | 41-48 | 20-2 |
| Second | session | 49-59 | 21-3 |
| The Co | mmission's visit to the Federal | | |
| Repu | blic of Germany | 60-65 | 33-34 |
| Third | session | 66 | 34 |
| CHAPTER 3: | THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE DISCRIMINA- | | |
| omit ibit 5. | TION (EMPLOYMENT AND OCCUPATION) | | |
| | CONVENTION, 1958 (NO. 111) IN | | |
| | RELATION TO PROTECTION AGAINST | | |
| | DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF | | |
| | POLITICAL OPINION | 67-96 | 36-46 |
| O L-OK IO | Simple without the continuous contents | | |
| Articl | e 1, paragraph 1, of the Convention | 10 210 1110 | |
| | inition) | 73-75 | 37-38 |
| | e 1, paragraph 2 (exceptions based | | |
| | he inherent requirements of a | 74.00 | |
| | icular job) | 76-82 | 38-40 |
| | e 1, paragraph 3 (scope of the | 00.00 | 10.11 |
| | ession "employment and occupation") | | 40-4 |
| | es 2 and 3 (obligations arising | 07.00 | |
| | the provisions of the Convention) | | 41-4 |
| Articl | e 4 | 91–96 | 42-4 |
| CHAPTER 4: | EARLIER EXAMINATION OF THE SITUATION | | |
| | BY ILO SUPERVISORY BODIES | 97-108 | 47-50 |

minutellie additional minute will be a

| Legislative and executive powers | | similar la sidel | Paragraphs | Pages | <u>P</u> | Paragraphs | Pages |
|--|--|--|------------|-----------------|--|------------|------------------|
| THE LEGISLATION GOVERNING THE FUBLIC SERVICE IN THE FEBERAL REPUBLIC SERVICE IN THE FEBERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY 109-236 51-88 Rhineland-Palatinate 379-388 133-11 379-388 133-11 379-388 133-11 379-388 133-11 379-388 31 | CHAPTER 5: | STRUCTURE OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE AND | | | Baden-Wiirttemberg | 331-343 | 122_125 |
| SERVICE N THE FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF CERMANY 109-236 51-88 | Omit the St | | | | | | |
| Constitutional structure of the State | | | | | | | |
| Schleswig-Holstein | | | 100_236 | 51 00 | Phineland-Palatinate | 370 300 | |
| Constitutional structure of the State | | OF GERPANI | 109-230 | 21-00 | | | |
| Division of powers between the Federation and the Länder 110 51 Legislative and executive powers 111-112 51-52 Judiciary 113-115 52 Execution of the laws 116-118 52-53 Structure of the public service 119-125 53-56 Fundamental rights guaranteed by the Constitution and guarantees for political parties 126-136 56-60 Public service legislation 137-17 60-66 Convention No. 111 400-411 184-18 Definition and composition of the public service legislation 137-17 60-66 Convention No. 111 412-420 188-15 Job security 60-69 Convention No. 111 412-420 188-15 Job security 164-168 64-65 The duties of officials 169-171 65-66 CHAPTER 9: THE NUMERICAL IMPORTANCE OF CASES 421-448 196-20 Historical and doctrinal context of the duty of faithfulness to the free democratic basic order 172-186 66-69 Legislative provisions at present in 187-191 69-70 Frinciples for the verification of 187-191 69-70 Frinciples for the verification of 187-191 69-70 Situation with regard to preparatory service (Vorbereltungsdienst) 206-210 77-78 Situation with regard to preparatory service (Vorbereltungsdienst) 206-210 77-78 Allegations made by the WFTU 237-241 89-90 Information and documentation provided by the WFTU 242-255 90-96 Analytical summary of documented cases 266-279 95-96 EMAPTER 6: THE POSITION OF EMECUNENT OF CRASES THE POSITION OF EMELOR TWO MORKERS? THE POSITION OF EMELOR TWO MORKERS? THE POSITION OF EMELOR TWO MORKERS? THE POSITION OF EMELOR TWO Consider Test pack to consider the gislation and current consider legislation and current prosition of the position of regarisations which consid | Const | itutional structure of the State | 110-118 | 51-53 | benieswig-noistein | 307-373 | 130-137 |
| Analytic and the Länder | | | | 0.2 00 | CHAPTER 7: THE POSITION OF THE GOVERNMENT OF | | |
| Legislative and executive powers | | | | 51 | | 394-398 | 141-183 |
| Securitor of the laws 116-118 52-53 | | | | William William | Dellawas In I december | | 212 200 |
| Execution of the laws | | | | | CHAPTER 8: THE POSITION OF EMPLOYERS' AND | | |
| Structure of the public service 119-125 53-56 | | | | | | 399-420 | 184-195 |
| Fundamental rights guaranteed by the Constitution and guarantees for political parties | | | | | MONITOR OF THE PROPERTY OF THE | 377.420 | 104 175 |
| Constitution and guarantees for political parties 126-136 56-60 Practice to be consistent with | | | 117 113 | 33 30 | The position of organisations which | | |
| Public service legislation 137-171 60-66 Convention No. 111 Model 184-18 184-18 Model | | | | | | | |
| Public service legislation | | | 126-136 | 56-60 | | | |
| Definition and composition of the public service 137-154 60-63 Consider the situation in the Federal Republic as wholly consistent with 155-163 61-64 Convention No. 111 412-420 188-151 180 | | | | | | | |
| Service | | | 131-111 | 00-00 | | | 104-100 |
| The rights and safeguards of officials 155-163 63-64 Convention No. 111 412-420 188-15 185-163 185-163 63-64 Convention No. 111 412-420 188-15 185-163 185-163 185-163 185-163 185-163 185-163 185-163 185-163 185-165 | | | 137_154 | 60 63 | | | |
| in the recruitment process 155-163 63-64 | | | | 00-03 | | | |
| Job security | | | | 62 61. | | | |
| The duties of officials | | | | | Convencion No. 111 | 412-420 | 100-195 |
| Duty of faithfulness to the free democratic basic order | | | | | CHAPTER O. THE NUMERICAL IMPORTANCE OF CACES | 1.21 1.1.0 | 106 202 |
| democratic basic order | | | 109-171 | 03-00 | CHAITER 9. THE NOMERICAL IMPORTANCE OF CASES | 421-440 | 196-203 |
| Historical and doctrinal context of the duty of faithfulness 172-186 66-69 Länder employment 429-445 198-20 Legislative provisions at present in force 187-191 69-70 Baden-Württemberg 431-433 198 198 197 198-20 198- | | | 172 226 | 66 05 | Public service employment in coneral | 1.22 1.21. | 106 107 |
| duty of faithfulness | | | 1/2-230 | 00-03 | | | |
| Raden-Württemberg | | | 172 106 | 66 60 | | | |
| Force | 그는 사람들은 그렇게 되었다. 그렇게 하는 사람들은 그 사람들은 그 사람들이 되었다면 하는 것이 되었다. 그렇게 되었다면 그렇게 되었다면 그렇게 되었다. 그 그렇게 되었다면 그 그 그 없는데 그 사람들이 되었다면 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 그 | | 1/2-100 | 00-09 | | | |
| Principles for the verification of faithfulness | | [[마스트] [[마스트] - [[hot]] - [[hot]] - [[hot]] - [[hot]] - [[hot]] - [[hot]] - [hot]] - [hot] | 107 101 | 60.70 | | | |
| Faithfulness | | | 10/-191 | 69-70 | | | |
| Situation with regard to preparatory service (Vorbereitungsdienst) 206-210 77-78 North Rhine-Westphalia 442 201 Situation of salaried employees and wage earners 211-212 78-79 Decisions of the courts 213-236 79-85 CHAPTER 6: THE ALLEGATIONS SUBMITTED AND RELATED DOCUMENTATION 237-393 89-140 Allegations made by the WFTU 237-241 89-90 Information and documentation provided by the WFTU 242-255 90-95 Information and documentation received from other sources 256-259 95-96 Analytical summary of documented cases 260-274 96-110 Hessen 441 200-20 North Rhine-Westphalia 442 201 Saarland 520 Saarland 620 S | | | 100 005 | 70 77 | | | |
| Service (Vorbereitungsdienst) 206-210 77-78 North Rhine-Westphalia 442 201 | | | , 192-205 | 70-77 | | | |
| Situation of salaried employees and wage earners | | | 006 010 | 77 70 | North Phine Westshalie | | |
| Pecisions of the courts | | | 206-210 | 11-18 | | | |
| Decisions of the courts | | | 011 010 | 70 70 | | | |
| CHAPTER 6: THE ALLEGATIONS SUBMITTED AND RELATED DOCUMENTATION 237-393 89-140 Allegations made by the WFTU 237-241 89-90 Information and documentation provided by the WFTU 242-255 90-95 Information and documentation received from other sources 256-259 95-96 Analytical summary of documented cases 260-274 96-110 CHAPTER 10: FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 449-594 204-255 Borland scope of the inquiry 451-453 204-200 Role of the World Federation of Trade Unions in the procedure 454 205 Government's objection that judicial remedies available on the national level have not been exhausted 455-468 205-21 Law and practice in the Federal Republic | | | | | Further considerations | 445-448 | 202-203 |
| CHAPTER 6: THE ALLEGATIONS SUBMITTED AND RELATED DOCUMENTATION 237-393 89-140 Allegations made by the WFTU 237-241 89-90 Information and documentation provided by the WFTU 242-255 90-95 Information and documentation received from other sources 256-259 95-96 Analytical summary of documented cases 260-274 96-110 Origin and scope of the inquiry 451-453 204-20 Role of the World Federation of Trade Unions in the procedure 500-274 96-110 Origin and scope of the inquiry 451-453 204-20 Role of the World Federation of Trade Unions in the procedure 500-274 96-110 Law and practice in the Federal Republic | Dec | isions of the courts | 213-236 | 79-85 | CHARTER 10. EINDINGS AND DECOMMENDATIONS | 110 501 | 001 055 |
| RELATED DOCUMENTATION | CHAPTED 6. | THE ALLECATIONS SHEMITTED AND | | | CHAPTER 10: FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS | 449-594 | 204-259 |
| Allegations made by the WFTU | CHAPTER O: | | 227_202 | 90 140 | Origin and scope of the inquiry | 451_452 | 204 205 |
| Allegations made by the WFTU | | RELATED DOCUMENTATION | 237-393 | 89-140 | | 431-433 | 204-205 |
| Information and documentation provided by the WFTU | Allegations made by the WFTU | | 237-241 | 89-90 | | 454 | 205 |
| by the WFTU | | | 17 | | | | 2 T 19 C 2 C 2 C |
| Information and documentation received remedies available on the national level have not been exhausted | | The state of the s | 242-255 | 90-95 | 가는 것 없는 것 같아. 하는 하면 보고 있다는 보험이 되고 있다면 있는 것 같아 있다면 하는 것 같아. 그리고 있다면 하는 것 같아 보다 하는 것 같아. 그리고 있다면 하는 것 같아. 그리고 있다면 하는 것 같아. | | |
| from other sources | | | | 2.5 5.5 | | | |
| Analytical summary of documented cases 260-274 96-110 Law and practice in the Federal Republic | | | | 95-96 | | 455-468 | 205-210 |
| | | | | | | | |
| the grounds for the measures taken 265-268 97-99 Of Germany with respect to the matters | | grounds for the measures taken | | 97-99 | of Germany with respect to the matters | | |
| | | | | | | 469-500 | 210-220 |
| Incidental effects of exclusion from Applicability of Convention No. 111 to | | | -07 -14 | ,, 100 | | | -10 220 |
| | | | 273-274 | 100-110 | | | 220-222 |
| Case descriptions | | | | | | 201 303 | |
| | | | | | | 506-509 | 222-223 |
| | 100 | | 2.5 550 | *** *** | | | |

| | Paragraphs | Pages |
|---|--|-----------|
| The bearing of the definition of "dis- | | |
| crimination" in Article 1, paragraph 1, | A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH | |
| of the Convention | 510-520 | 223-227 |
| Convention No. 111 | 521_523 | 227 229 |
| The significance of recent judgements of | | |
| the European Court of Human Rights Inherent job requirements - applicability of Article 1, paragraph 2, of Convention | on | 228-229 |
| No. 111 to the measures under considera | - | |
| tion in the present inquiry Implications of variations of policy an practice among different authorities | ıd | 229-243 |
| within the Federal Republic | 540 545 | 222 224 |
| The effects on the functioning of the | 540-545 | 232-234 |
| public service of activities on the basis of which it has been sought to | | |
| exclude particular individuals from | | |
| the public service | re | 234-236 |
| service in times of conflict or crisi | TC | 026 027 |
| The undifferentiated application to all | s 554-556 | 236-237 |
| officials of the duty of faithfulness | 557.565 | 007 000 |
| The appoint situation of the li | 557-565 | 237-239 |
| The special situation of teachers in | 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 | |
| regard to the duty of faithfulness General conclusion regarding the applic tion of Article 1, paragraph 2, of | a- | |
| Convention No. 111 | 573 | 242-243 |
| Activities prejudicial to the security of the State - applicability of Article 4 | | All |
| Convention No. 111 to the measures unde | 0 1 | |
| consideration in the present inquiry | 57/, 501 | 24.2 24.5 |
| Recommendations | 502 504 | |
| | | 245-248 |
| Dissenting opinion by Professor | | 010 051 |
| Parra-Aranguren | | 249-251 |
| Cobindian | r | 4 |
| Schindler | | 252-253 |
| APPENDIX I: Text of the substantive provisions of the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 | | |
| (No. 111) | | 261-262 |
| APPENDIX II: Provisions of the ILO Constitution | | |
| relating to Commissions of Inquiry | | 263_265 |
| reserved to commissions of inquity | | 203-203 |

CHAPTER 1

EVENTS LEADING TO THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE COMMISSION

Representation made by the World Federation of Trade Unions under article 24 of the ILO Constitution

- 1. By letter dated 13 June 1984, the World Federation of Trade Unions (WFTU), referring to article 24 of the Constitution of the International Labour Organisation, submitted a representation to the International Labour Office alleging that the Government of the Federal Republic of Germany had failed to fulfil the obligations incumbent on it by virtue of its ratification of the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111). The WFTU stated that the non-observance by the Federal Republic of Germany of its obligations was the result of discriminatory practices applied to public servants and candidates for public service posts in respect of recruitment, extension of service or dismissal, for political reasons.
- 2. The WFTU recalled that on 24 January 1978 it had already submitted a representation against the Government of the Federal Republic of Germany concerning the Government's failure to secure by its legislation and practice the effective observance of the above mentioned Convention. In that representation it had especially stressed discriminatory practice on the basis of political opinion in the procedure for the verification of loyalty to the national Constitution of public servants so-called work-bans ("Berufsverbote") based in particular on the following documents:
 - Common declaration of the Federal Chancellor and the Prime Ministers of the constituent States of 28 January 1972;
 - Guiding principles of the Federal Constitutional Court as regards the obligation of loyalty in the public service, decision of the Second Senate dated 22 May 1975;
 - Principles for investigating loyalty to the Constitution (updated 19 May 1976);
 - Principles for investigating loyalty to the Constitution (new version of 10 January 1979).